



**MINUTES OF MEETING
TUESDAY 20 NOVEMBER 2007
WILDFOWL & WETLANDS TRUST, PENCLACWYDD, LLANELLI**

Present

Jane Hodges (JH) Acting-chair	Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Authority (PCNPA)
Julian Atkins (JA)	City & County of Swansea (CCoS)
Blaise Bullimore (BB)	EMS Officer
Anne Bunker (AB)	Countryside Council for Wales (CCW)
Phil Coates (PC)	South Wales Sea Fisheries Committee (SWSFC)
Kate Collins (KC)	Environment Agency Wales (EAW)
Dusi Thomas	Dwr Cymru-Welsh Water (DCWW)
Rebecca Wright (RW)	CCW

1 Welcome, apologies & personnel matters

Apologies:

Deb Hill, Chair	City & County of Swansea
Simeon Jones	Carmarthenshire County Council (phone message picked up after meeting)
Isabel Macho	Carmarthenshire County Council
Trevor Theobald	Pembrokeshire County Council

KC and DT were welcomed back on their return from maternity leave.

Members were informed that Deb Hill was coping well with her course of chemotherapy; they again extended their best wishes.

2 Minutes of meeting 19 September 2007

Minutes received subject to noting:

Page 1: JA was a member of the BILEG, not the chair.

Page 3, first bullet under *Agreed as priorities*: abbreviation RG should read RA.

3 Matters arising from minutes of 19 September 2007 & not on the agenda

Item 4

(PC) CEFAS are undertaking appropriate assessment work for the proposed Three Rivers Regulating order on behalf of the WAG.

(BB) A meeting with senior CCC officers has now been arranged.

Item 8

(PC) Raising fishing industry awareness: PC had circulated relevant authorities with proposals and awaits responses.

(JA) Nothing further heard regarding commercial algal harvesting. Public health implications of harvesting noted.

The issue prompted a discussion on management of unregulated and indirectly regulated activities.

Noted:

Recent paper in law journal exploring relationships between public rights and ownership rights and obligations; specifically, the environmental obligations on the Crown Estate of safeguarding its (seabed) property from damage. PC to forward for circulation. **ACTION PC ✓**

Item 9

Officer increment correction. An increment *had* been paid at the beginning of the financial year. As it had not been near the anniversary of commencement of the contract, it had been misidentified as a cost of living increase.

4 Work programme review and forward planning

a) Review

Noted:

- Several issues carried forward from last meeting. Refer to previous minutes for decisions already taken.
- Management scheme development has slipped by at least a quarter and key background tasks (eg information acquisition and GIS development) have been on hold and require substantial time input to bring up to date and confirm outstanding data gaps.
- Liaison and awareness raising work had absorbed much time since last meeting and the time requirement for this task is increasing.
- Members felt unable to decide on or prioritise information handling tasks in the absence of more detailed information.

Agreed:

- Revise work programme, rolling back task time-lines as appropriate, date with end of calendar year 2007 and avoid further revision until end of 2008.
- To better inform members of information shortfalls, at next meeting BB to provide a short update of information held, including:
 - List of bodies consulted for information;
 - Synopsis of information provided and its value;
 - GIS demonstration of existing map layers;
 - Identified information and data gaps.
- Further liaison with SWSFC required to resolve discrepancies between different information sources, and University Swansea regarding research activities in the site.

ACTIONS: BB

- DT to investigate availability of consent data provided by Lewis Keil (as spreadsheet) as GIS layers

ACTION: DT

b) Forward planning

Pressures & threats identification

Noted:

- The pros and cons of a public consultation were again rehearsed.
- Input from some RA members and from environmental interests was disappointingly sparse despite structured information gathering *proforma* widely distributed to members and identified interested parties in late November – early December 2006¹.
- The onus is on RA members to source and forward information (preferably) or, at least, contacts within member RAs for specific information.

Agreed:

- Last call for additions and comment on current draft by 14 December. **ACTION: ALL**
- Revise, and reissue as second draft two weeks before next meeting. **ACTION: BB**
- Include nested mini-maps of known activity distribution in document.
- Reconfirmed - based on minimal responses received by other EMSs, document will not be circulated as public consultation, but should be used to stimulate interest and information during liaison with interested parties and Liaison Forum interest group representatives.

Awareness raising

Noted:

- It has become increasingly apparent that increased and effective awareness-raising efforts are required within relevant and competent authorities as well as with the general public.
- Website:
 - statistics indicate that it is being used;
 - comes out at or near top of appropriately worded Google searches;
 - should be accessible to most professional interests in the site, even if not all the general public;
 - is only useful if people know of EMS and seek the website out.

Agreed:

- Members to identify further opportunities for inclusion of CB&E information, particularly identifying website, in RA's:
 - publications;
 - internal briefing papers (newsletters, committee reports etc);
 - e-portals & other public-facing IT links;targeted at both internal RA and public awareness raising, and to identify relevant contacts to facilitate inclusion of CB&E information. **ACTION: ALL**
- Develop website as a primary site information source and develop a range of 'signposts' to website, eg business cards, promotional items.
- Glossy leaflets are relatively ineffective or poor value. Production shelved for time being in favour of above 'signposts' to website.

¹ The proforma is attached as Annex for information and as a guide to inform further input.

- Develop bespoke, location specific panels for long-term placement at suitable venues, primarily targeting local communities rather than visitors; WWT, Millennium Coastal Park, Pembrey Country Park identified; further locations suggested. All members to provide further recommendations. **ACTION: ALL**
- Develop / maintain links with BAP and other relevant partnerships (eg WCMP).
- Postpone final identification of promotional products.
- Postpone consideration of contract to develop awareness-raising material..

Liaison

Noted:

- the relatively substantial proportion of time spent on liaison by BB since the last meeting highlighted both the need for public and community liaison, and the time commitment required for it to be effective.
- Members need to determine their relative short-medium term priority between development of the management scheme document and liaison.
- BB recommended consideration of a short contract to make contact with all addressees on existing contact lists so as to begin re-establishment of liaison fora. **ACTION: ALL to consider**

Information collection

Noted:

- Potential partnership project with Pembrokeshire Marine SAC - desk-study to summarise environmental effects of fishing techniques on site features. The value and need in advance of determination of conservation issues was queried, but outputs would inform identification of management requirements. **ACTION: ALL to consider**
- Information on distribution and intensity of bait collection effort is required. The logistics of undertaking a survey would be make using contractors expensive. Alternative options require consideration **ACTION: ALL to consider**
- Potential contribution to the Pembrokeshire Coastal Forum managed SW Wales Recreation Audit project to secure additional data gathering tailored to CB&E site requirements. Discussed at length. Further information requested². **ACTION: BB**

5 Budget: finance planning

a) Income

Noted:

- Contributions for current FY confirmed by: CCW (subject to finalising draft revised 3 year MoU with CCoS); EA (2 years); DCWW (requested a brief update with invoice); PCNPA; SWSFC.

² Aim & objectives and further information e-mailed to members 22 Nov 2007. Further information will follow after newly recruited project officer has a begun work.

- Invoices to be raised early in new year as possible **ACTION: BB**
- Members not committed to future FY contributions urged to commence / continue internal bidding to secure resources for next and subsequent FYs (CCC, CCoS, PCC).

ACTION: BB to follow up

b) expenditure

Expenditure planning information note tabled to guide discussion

Previously agreed / noted:

- Software: security (purchased) & web authoring
- Bespoke, location-specific site information panels; production costs c£150 – £200 ea for A1 size (internal display; panels for external display likely substantially more expensive); plus compilation & design time. Agreement reconfirmed.
- Website (and other) translations costs

Agreed - postpone decisions on:

- potential partnership desk-study to summarise environmental effects of fishing techniques on site features with Pembrokeshire Marine SAC pending further information from PM SAC officer.
- potential contribution to the PCF managed SW Wales Recreation Audit project to secure tailored data gathering to CB&E site pending further information on objectives, current funding contributors and proposed further developments.
- short contracts to i) contact with all addressees on existing contact lists so as to begin re-establishment of liaison fora and ii) develop awareness raising materials pending drafting specifications of detailed objectives, time requirements and cost estimates.

ACTIONS: BB

6 Annual review MoU and ToR

Agreed:

- ToR reconfirmed without modification
- MoU requires modification to accommodate:
 - attendance at RAG meetings (see 9 below)
 - any RAG specific issues over-spilling from the revision of the MoA between CCW and CCoS concerning CCW's financial contribution to the RAG.

7 Management strategy

Noted: no action as comments too recently received. **ACTION: BB to accommodate & recirculate**

Agreed: postpone sign-off.

8 Pressures, threats & issues report

Noted: no further comments received and no further action yet taken to amend document.

Agreed: final call for comments on current draft by 14 December.

ACTION: ALL

9 Observers at RAG meetings

Noted:

- a request had been received for attendance by a non-member of RAG received;
- similar requests to other RAGs had been refused on the grounds that: i) the public are not normally permitted to attend public bodies' technical officer meetings; and ii) there was concern that making such one or two exceptions would risk setting precedents making it difficult to refuse subsequent requests;
- a RAG policy on non-RA member observers is required.

Agreed - attendance will normally be limited to RA officers except for:

- genuine work experience students attending in the capacity of temporary members of RA staff, subject to notification to the Chair in advance and adherence to the ToR and MoU;
- third parties (stakeholders, community representatives etc) may be invited, or requests from third parties may be approved, to attend specific agenda items where specialist input is required. In such circumstances, the item would be taken at the beginning of the agenda, after which the third party(ies) would leave the meeting.

Agreed: amend RAG MoU accordingly

ACTION: BB

10. EMS Officer report

Noted:

- BB had had one week's leave since previous meeting and was taking a further week in early December.
- Old, CCoS hosted, Carmarthen Bay SAC website now closed down.
- BB had attended:
 - UK Virtual MPA steering group meeting (September);
 - UK MPA & EMS conference (Scarborough) 2-4 October;
 - Corepoint ICZM workshop (Pembrokeshire) 9-10 October during which an EMS presentation was given in partnership with the Pembrokeshire Marine SAC Officer
 - Wales Coastal & Maritime Partnership meeting (Aberystwyth) to give a presentation on EMS in Wales in partnership with the Pembrokeshire Marine SAC Officer. The meeting had provided opportunities to provide feedback for WAG during a workshop session on EMS aspects of the Wales Environment Strategy and to accept a request for a visit by members of the WAG marine policy team.
- Other tasks that had absorbed time included:
 - addressing problem issues with the CCW-CCoS MoU;
 - PCF Recreation audit project;
 - liaison with Swansea University regarding commercial interest in jellyfish exploitation in the Bay;
 - continued liaison on the razorfish electrofishing project;

- substantial amount of ad-hoc, mainly reactive, liaison;
- articles for Carmarthenshire CC biodiversity and PCF newsletters³.
- Most recent GEMS meeting had noted:
 - the suggestion of a RAG chairs meeting had resurfaced;
 - concern on the difficulty of obtaining information from CCW on the site feature assessments reported to the JNCC to inform reporting to the EC; that the Pembrokeshire Marine SAC chair has been tasked to write to the CCW CX requesting action to provide this information⁴.
- Scheduled in the near future:
 - presentation to Swansea University MSc students;
 - CCW monitoring workshop (Aberystwyth) end November;
 - re-launch of CB&E Recreation and Tourism special interest group in early 2008.

11 Relevant authority updates

a) consents & information exchange

Noted:

- Helwick Bank public enquiry (BB) - Inspector's report and Government View letter had been issued in early August. Concerns that it had not been reported to the RAG were noted. BB to forward (accompanies these minutes). BB had noted some possible inconsistencies with the legislation in the inspector's report and asked for CCW's views.
- Site assessments & report to EC (BB) – no further news.
- Whiteford mussels (RW/PC) – CCW had consented to hand-gathering and dredging but no dredging had taken place. Survey work continues to inform bird prey resource modelling. Bird disturbance by hand gatherers was noted as an additional issue to prey resource depletion.
- Welsh Fisheries Strategy (PC) – still awaited but release reportedly imminent⁵.
- Welsh Fisheries Management Review (PC) – still with Minister and awaited.
- SWSFC resources (PC) – remain insecure. None allocated for a Three Rivers Regulating Order public inquiry. Concern as Dee PI had cost c £100k and been grant-aided.
- Cockle mortalities (PC) – Bangor University appointed consultants by S&WWFC Ltd to undertake the initial scoping study work (SFIA / CCW grant of c£19k + funding in-kind); meeting in Swansea on 5 October; Bangor in liaison with Swansea University on their research under WiSE funding; report due end of March. At October meeting, research programme identified as likely necessary to investigate all relevant issues estimates as 3 years duration and cost of up to £650k. PC had reported this to Carms CC Scrutiny Committee meeting, who had not appeared overly perturbed in the context of the annual and recurring economic return of a healthy cockle fishery of £2-3m *per annum*.

³ PCF newsletter at <http://www.pembrokeshirecoastalforum.org.uk/documents/newsletter161MB.pdf>. Pages from CCC biodiversity newsletter accompany these minutes.

⁴ Response has been received and accompanies these minutes.

⁵ Published since meeting. Consultation open until 7 March 2008.

- EA review of consents (KC) – CB&E had been brought forward whilst KC had been on maternity leave and work has commenced. All three constituent Natura 2000 sites are included.
- Shoreline Management Plan revision ('SMP2') (BB) – has commenced. RW reported that CCW is member of SMP partnership.
- Migratory fish management (PC) – EA and DEFRA in negotiation over transferring responsibility for management of all species out to 6 miles to EA.
- Molluscan hand-gathering (PC/BB) – several reports of substantial hand-gathering by Chinese individuals of various low-shore species not usually targeted, from Rhossili to Saundersfoot / Tenby. All in compliance with SWSFC byelaws but most species believed not to be health classified in the event that they be offered for commercial sale (PC). Enquiries by public health officers suggested that despite the substantial quantities collected, the shellfish were allegedly for private consumption (PC).
- Hydraulic dredging (PC) – original applicant to hydraulic dredge for razor-clams in the Bay has applied to dredge for other clam species with a larger dredge than is currently authorized by SWSFC. SWSFC minded to permit outside the SAC. BB advised that the hydraulic dredging in Liverpool Bay agreed by Natural England is of very limited extent and to inform an appropriate assessment: NE do not, as reported by industry, have no concerns about hydraulic dredging.
- Shellfish Waters Directive (PC/DT) – storm water discharges from a number of locations in Burry Inlet had reportedly exceeded the number authorized by EA (Swansea evening post 17 Nov 2007). DT to investigate further and report back⁶.

b) research & monitoring reports

Noted:

(AB) - CCW research project tracking colour-marked oystercatchers to establish exchange between Burry Inlet and Three Rivers has begun.

(JH) – Article in recent BTO News magazine referring to CCW contracted research within CB&E site. Concern was expressed that the RAG had not been advised of the study or reported outcomes. AB to contact Alex Banks, BTO for copy of article⁷ **ACTION: AB**

⁶ DT's colleague Lewis Kiel has offered to attend the next meeting. Members views were sought in e-mail from DT on 21 November 2007. :Response so far is in favour. **ACTION** outstanding views to JEH and BB by return please.

Since the meeting further articles have been published in the Western Mail:

<http://icwales.icnetwork.co.uk/news/wales-news/2007/12/10/sewage-creates-coastal-cesspits-91466-20227604/>

and Swansea Evening Post :

<http://www.swep.co.uk/displayNode.jsp?nodeId=161389&command=displayContent&sourceNode=161372&contentPK=19246420&moduleName=InternalSearch&formname=sidebarsearch>

<http://www.swep.co.uk/displayNode.jsp?nodeId=161389&command=displayContent&sourceNode=161372&contentPK=19246442&moduleName=InternalSearch&formname=sidebarsearch>

⁷ Scanned pdf copy accompanies these minutes.

12 Other business

None raised

13 Date(s) of next meeting(s)

Confirmed: 10.30 Tuesday 26 February 2008

Subsequent meeting: 10.30 Tuesday 29 April 2008

Meeting closed at 15.15

ANNEX OPERATIONS AND ACTIVITIES INFORMATION COLLECTION

Name	<input type="text"/>	Organisation	<input type="text"/>
<i>Contact details</i>	Phone	E-mail	<input type="text"/>

Operations and activities may directly or indirectly damage, degrade or disturb one or more conservation features. To provide a basis for assessment of pressures and threats, it is important to determine whether, where, when and how much human activities occur.

This list includes all activities or operations known or considered likely to occur within the CB&E EMS; it is almost certainly not complete – **please add any further activities where most appropriate or at the end of the table.** Inclusion in the list does not mean activities are necessarily considered a threat to features or to be in need of additional management.

Activities and operations are grouped below into the following broad categories:

[EXPLOITATION OF LIVING RESOURCES](#)

[CULTIVATION OF LIVING RESOURCES](#)

[EXPLOITATION OF NON-LIVING RESOURCES](#)

[CIVIL ENGINEERING](#)

[WASTE DISPOSAL](#)

[DOCKS, MARINAS & SHIPPING](#)

[RECREATION](#)

[MILITARY](#)

[POLLUTION RESPONSE](#)

[MISCELLANEOUS](#)

Activity or operation (*) (Operations marked with an asterisk are or may be plans or projects)	Information about activity / operation Spatial distribution, frequency, timing, intensity
EXPLOITATION OF LIVING RESOURCES	
Trawling: beam	
Trawling otter	
Toothed dredging	
Bladed dredging: mussel	
Bladed dredging: mussel seed	
Bladed dredging: oyster	
Cockle dredge mechanical	
Dredging: deep hydraulic (eg WJID)	

Activity or operation (*) (Operations marked with an asterisk are or may be plans or projects)	Information about activity / operation Spatial distribution, frequency, timing, intensity
Aquaculture: algae	
Aquaculture: finfish - sea cages or impoundments *	
Aquaculture: crustaceans - sea cages or impoundments *	
Aquaculture: molluscan 'ranching' ^{8*}	
Aquaculture: molluscan 'farming' ^{9*}	
Aquaculture: land based semi-enclosed / recirculation *	
Aquaculture: predator control	
Aggregation devices (eg crab tiles)	
EXPLOITATION OF NON-LIVING RESOURCES	
Water abstraction*	
Aggregate dredging*	
Oil & gas exploration: seismic survey*	
Oil & gas exploration & production: drilling operations*	
Oil & gas exploration & production: operational* & accidental discharges	
Renewable energy generation: tidal barrage*#	
Renewable energy generation: tidal impoundment *#	
Renewable energy generation: tidal current turbine*#	

⁸ Wild stock enhancement; deposition of juveniles on seabed, semi-managed on-growing and subsequent harvesting of commercially sized individuals; cf "farming"

⁹ Molluscan culture using trestles, ropes, cages or other structures; cf "ranching"

Activity or operation (*) (Operations marked with an asterisk are or may be plans or projects)	Information about activity / operation Spatial distribution, frequency, timing, intensity
Renewable energy generation: wave energy	
Renewable energy generation: offshore wind *#	
CIVIL ENGINEERING	
Construction*	
Land claim *	
Coast protection: hard defence (sea walls/breakwaters)*#	
Coast protection: soft defence *#	
Coast protection: groynes	
Coast protection: barrage	
Coast protection: beach replenishment *#	
Coast protection: surge/tidal barrage *#	
Foreshore deposit of rock, rubble etc	
Barrage: amenity,	
Artificial reef	
Engineered freshwater watercourses *#	
Pipelines *#	
Power/communication cables*	
WASTE DISPOSAL	
<i>Effluent disposal: domestic*</i>	

Activity or operation (*) (Operations marked with an asterisk are or may be plans or projects)	Information about activity / operation Spatial distribution, frequency, timing, intensity
Effluent disposal: industrial	
Effluent disposal: thermal *	
Inorganic wastes & debris ¹⁰	
Dredge spoil disposal *	
Urban / industrial run-off	
<i>Agricultural run-off</i>	
DOCKS, MARINAS & SHIPPING	
Dock, harbour & marina structures: construction*	
Dock, harbour & marina structures: maintenance	
Dredging: capital *	
Dredging: maintenance	
Vessel traffic (commercial)	
Moorings	
Anchoring (commercial & recreational)	
Vessel maintenance (incl. antifouling)	
Ballast water discharge	
Refuse & sewage disposal	
Operational discharges	
<i>Accidents: vessel groundings</i>	
Accidents: fuel oil & / or petrochemical discharges	
Accidents: non-petrochemical cargo losses / discharges	
Accidents: salvage operations	

¹⁰ Litter, fly-tipping

Activity or operation (*) (Operations marked with an asterisk are or may be plans or projects)	Information about activity / operation Spatial distribution, frequency, timing, intensity
RECREATION	
Angling	
Bait collection: boulder turning	
Bait collection: digging	
Bait collection: salting	
Bait collection: other sediment shore techniques	
Recreational boating: high speed power craft	
Recreational boating: low speed power craft	
Recreational boating: sail	
Recreational boating: canoeing	
Recreational boating: other non-mechanically powered craft	
Surfing	
Scuba diving, snorkelling	
Casual shore recreation	
Wildfowling	
Marine wildlife watching/eco-tourism	
Vehicles on foreshore	
<i>Light aircraft</i>	
MILITARY	
Military activity: ordnance ranges	
<i>Military activity: ordnance</i>	

Activity or operation (*) (Operations marked with an asterisk are or may be plans or projects)	Information about activity / operation Spatial distribution, frequency, timing, intensity
<i>disposal</i>	
<i>Military activity: aircraft</i>	
POLLUTION RESPONSE	
Oil spill response: at sea dispersant	
Oil spill response: at sea recovery	
Oil spill response: shore washing	
Oil spill response: shore chemical	
Oil spill response: shore substrate removal	
Oil spill response: shore cleaning - physical	
Oil spill response: shore cleaning - ancillary activities	
MISCELLANEOUS	
Archaeology & salvage	
Education	
Science research	
Animal welfare operations & sanctuaries	